

Development of Islamic Integrated Education in Pakistan since 1947: Current Needs for the Globalized World

Waqar Un Nisa Faizi* Anila Fatima Shakil† Abdu Rehman‡

Abstract

Education entails much significance and prominence for building a nation. Every country has certain policies and planning in terms of how their education system should work. Since Pakistan has been independent of Islamic values and religious autonomy, Islamic education is the fundamental and most crucial element. In this regard, this research paper has aimed to discover the timeline of how Islamic education was integrated into the Pakistani curriculum. The research findings have suggested that the educational policies of Pakistan from 1969 to date are emphasizing the inclusion of Islamic education into the modern secular system. However, most Islamic-educated colleges are not effectively addressing Islamic education as required in national policies as part of the compulsory part of the curriculum. Nevertheless, a more effective balance between secular education and Islamic education is found between new Islamic integrated schools to prepare students for the challenges of this globalized world.

Key Words:

Historical
Development,
Islamic
Integrated
Education,
Globalized
World

Introduction

Educational policies and planning activities act as a pathway and framework towards the purpose where the social order of the country wants to take its generation following the philosophy and ideology of the state. There is a very

* Assistant Professor, Department of Education, Islamia College Peshawar, Peshawar, KP, Pakistan. Email: faizi@icp.edu.pk

† Associate Professor, Department of Education, Jinnah University for Women Karachi, Karachi, Sindh, Pakistan.

‡ Assistant Professor, Department of Teacher Education, Qurtuba University, D.I.Khan, KP, Pakistan.

significant position of policy in the moral framework and socio-economic milieu of the country. The Marxist-oriented countries or secular Western countries have always tried to integrate and incorporate the ideologies of their countries into their educational policies and system (Ichilov, 2013). Likewise, in the situation of Pakistan, the philosophy of life and national ideology was articulated way before the demarcation of its geographical boundaries. Pakistan was established on 14 August 1947, as demanded by sub-continent Muslims who wanted to live a life of Islam. It's known widely. Goal Resolution, adopted by the Pakistan Constitutional Assembly in 1973, as part of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan Constitution, which adequately defined and based Islamic Principles. The philosophy of life and national ideology was also articulated in the situation of Pakistan well before its geographical boundaries were demarcated. Pakistan was founded on 14 August 1947, as Muslims had demanded, and it is well known.

The Objective Resolution adopted by Pakistan's Constituent Assembly, which accurately described Islamic principles and Islamic ideology in Pakistan, was made in 1973 as part of Pakistan 's Constitution. In the research study of Green (2013), it was also found that education act as a significant block in the society to prepare the nation specifically the youth of the nation to achieve the ideologies of the country. The justification for Pakistan 's existence is based solely on its Islamic ideologies, so education policy and planning focus on Islamic Education and help the nation in translating the Islamic Ideology into everyday action of lives. In this research study, the focus is given on understanding the historical development of Islamic Integrated education in Pakistan after its independence while analyzing the need for current Islamic Integrated education following the globalized world.

Research Question

The research questions of this study are:

1. How Islamic integrated education system has been developed in Pakistan
2. What are the shortcomings of secular or Islamic education as a separate education system?

Objectives of the Study

This research focuses on the inclusion of Islamic education in the curriculum in Pakistan. In this regard, the research objectives of the study are:

1. To discover the educational policies of Pakistan since 1947
2. To analyze the current situation of Islamic integrated education system in Pakistan

Significance of the Study

One of the fundamental and integral aspects of Islamic tradition has been acquiring knowledge (Yasin & Jani, 2013). In the very first revelation of Al-Quran, the importance of knowledge is quite clear including formal and religious education. Therefore, Muslims must acquire knowledge. In this way, by the help of Islamic education in the education system of Pakistan, a Muslim learns basic teachings of Islam, like beliefs (Aqaid), worships, *seerat* (Durrani, 2013), etc. to lead the society in economic, political, legal and cultural aspects. It is therefore very important to explore the development of Islamic integrated system of education in Pakistan and analyze its functioning as per the needs of a globalized world.

Literature Review

The subject of Islamiyat has been incorporated into the curriculum of schools as a compulsory subject and in some cases, it is even compulsory subject in universities (Durrani, 2013). Whereas, in higher classes, this subject is also offered as an elective one to allow students to acquire Islamic knowledge fully. It is however unclear how long Islamic education has been incorporated into the education system as an essential feature. This study focused on the current situation in the integrated system of Islamic education.

Early Development of Islamic Education in Pakistan

In Article 31 of the constitution, it is specified that Pakistan will effort to make Islamic education necessary to motivate and facilitate the ideology of Pakistan and encourage unity and compliance of Islamic moral standards (Rust & Arribas, 2018). It is the justification behind having Islamiyat as the compulsory subject in classes. Below given is the timeline of national policies and conferences that have been taken place to enforce Islamic integrated education in Pakistan.

The First Educational Conference 1947

In the first education conference that had taken place soon after the independence of Pakistan started on date 27th November and last till 1st December 1947, it was made clear that educational system of this newborn country will never isolate itself with the Islamic theory of life while fulfilling the basic requirement and the country's needs (Hameed – ur – Rehman & Sewani, 2013). It thus became the basis for the education system and helped build Pakistan's further policies.

National Education Commission 1959

According to the study of Aziz et al. (2014), the 1959 National Committee on Education intended to present some proposals for a reform of Pakistan's education system. It was taken place during the government of Ayyub Khan. However, one research study has also presented that one of the most important characteristics of the report that was presented in this commission was the presentation of a full and formal procedure for education given by the educational experts (Ali, 2013). Though education experts have tried. The comments of Muhammad Ayyub Khan at that occasion were: *"Our educational system needs to be reorganized to reflect our spiritual, moral and cultural values in our education system."* (Shakil & Akhtar, 2012; pg. 300) It depicts that Islamic education and worldly education are a collective part of the education system.

Educational Policy 1969

After the national education commission 1959, In September 1969, the educational policy was implemented following the suggestions published by Governor Noor Khan, Marshal of West Pakistan Air. There were recommendations made on changing the educational system revolutionary and a greater number of the public has also supported the suggestion (Hameed – Ur – Rehman & Sewani, 2013). A major portion of suggestion given in the report was based on the beneficial aspect of education wherein some of the points were specifically focused on Islamic knowledge and thus the subject of Islamiyat receive the status of the obligatory subject till 10th class (Rust & Arribas, 2018).

Educational Policy 1972-80

In 1972-1980, a new educational program included Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto 's administration. Minister of Education Abdul Hafeez Pirzada announced in March 1972 a new education policy. The aim of this educational policy was also to improve education and make it common for everyone. It is the educational policy that has observed the significance of religious education which is why this policy decision to not have Islamiyat subject as a separate educational system but to include it with other courses (Aziz et al., 2014). It was found in the research of Shakil & Akhtar, (2012) This education policy of 1972 gave religious institutions the right of free environment to do their jobs in line with Islam 's interests.

Educational Policy 1978

Educational policy was published in 1978 during the governance of General Muhammad Zia Ul Haq, according to research by Mahmood et al. (2016). It has

given greater importance and scope on the theoretical aspect and this was the only policy that is recognized as the Islamic educational policy stated in the research of Rust & Arribas, (2018). The reason behind referring educational policy 1978 as Islamic educational policy is that it seems like the color of Islam.

Educational Policy 1992

Educational minister of that time (Mr. Fakhar Imam) has announced this educational policy 1993 which given emphasize to make the educational system of Pakistan that prepare students for the challenges and opportunities of the 21st century.

Educational Policy 1998-2010

In this policy, it is made clear that secondary education specifically nine and matric classes are the important classes of the entire educational system, therefore, Islamic education must be the part of this curriculum which helps them develop their personality as the progressive citizens of an Islamic state and concord devoted nations in the world at a larger scale (Hameed – ur – Rehman & Sewani, 2013).

National Educational Policy 2017

In the most recent national educational policy 2017, there was a whole chapter dedicated to Islamic education. In the Pakistani curriculum, this policy related to Islamic education was based on areas known as Quran teaching with translation, character building (TARBIYYA), and soul cleansing (TAZKIYYA-ANNAFS), the spread of Islamic ideology, and AHADIS and SIRAT-ATAYABA teaching. In this way, the educational system in Pakistan has always presented with the element of Islamic education as the foundation (Shakil & Akhtar, 2012).

Current situation of Education Integrated System and Needs for the Globalised World

In today's situation of the Pakistani educational system, a new model of private schooling in Pakistan is greatly observed wherein Islamic teaching is integrated with modern methods of education. The example of such educational institutions includes the Hidayah Montessori Preschool which is integrating Islamic instruction with private education. Besides this, Islamiyat as a subject has been taught in every school to teach Islamic education along with subjects like mathematics, science, English, and others. According to the study of Khattak (2014), there is a slew of schools that have opened in recent times for offering the conventional education along with the opportunity to learn Arabic and memorize

the Quran such as Suffah savior school, Al-Mumtaz Academy, and another hifz school where student learn Islamic education while capable of receiving an education that is necessary to be competent in this globalized and advanced world. There are some of the schools that go beyond just education in scripture while delivering an environment that is all-encompassed with Islamic education (Jackson, 2013). Such schools have the aim of instilling the morals and values of Islam in the lives of their students on the way of delivering the education that is swathed in religiosity. It can be said that such schools are transforming the perception of traditional Islamic education, which is often interpreted as mere memorization of the Quran.

However, in the starting, there were certain critiques that private Islamic schooling system is the idea that seems to be unnecessary in the state like Pakistan where the official religion is Islam and its educational policies are emphasizing to incorporate Islamic teachings in the curriculum (Rust & Arribas, 2018). However, despite having Islamiyat as the compulsory subject and making Islamic education as the integral part of daily lives, the modern religious school considered that private schools are secular since the subject of Islamiyat at schools is not given importance as per other subjects and does not frame the curriculum as a whole (Durrani, 2013).

Demand for private schools has increased significantly in Pakistan's urban cities (Hayneman & Stern, 2014). Unfortunately, regardless of being at every nook and cranny, private schools in Pakistan's metropolitan cities are still not able to meet the qualitative credentials and are following the same obsolete curriculum. However, the fee structure of private schools is completely independent and relatively expensive (Amjad & MacLeod, 2014). Schools in Pakistan are just portraying a controversial framework, under the name of Cambridge system students are being taught at the standards of government school with the same context of books, issued by the government. Even those students, who are paying a quite handsome amount in top-tier schools, are constrained to take additional tuitions. The only and fundamental goal of reputed private schools is to prepare students for the achievement of academic grades and they only focus on worldly education i.e. academic education.

In contrast with private schools, the educational systems –madrassahs or seminaries that are following Islamic models or helping students in memorizing the Quran are being criticized publically for abusing children (Ali, 2013). It has been observed that the ones, following the Islamic teaching prospectus, seem to be rejected by most of the people, belong to the elite class as they believe that private schools could be the best educational source of learning for their children rather than the seminaries.

Although, reality is far beyond the myths that usually people perceive for the seminaries. It is found that the Islamic academies tend to be more productive when it comes to building a strong foundation for students (Mehdi, 2013). Seminaries

are offering a complete suite of modern-time education, which includes; Cambridge curriculum, be it the subject of History, English, Arts, Arabic, etc. It has been noticed that students, acquiring education in Islamic institutes possess more knowledge from religious perspective than one who is being admitted in private schools. The core of seminaries is to help students in understanding the modern world from both perspectives, scientific and Islamic. For instance, a reputed and well-known academy named Science at Fajr Academy is teaching and guiding students in the light of Quranic scripture, embedded in creationism.

Such academies and seminaries aim to spread the knowledge in the religious context and to help Muslims in understanding and practicing their religion more piously (Mehdi, 2013). According to many Entrepreneurs, students who are honest, intelligent, curious, and can spread Islamic teachings through the power of their knowledge of Arabic and the Quran are their ideal and they admire such students most, whereas inculcating ethics is fundamental to this. Reflections – a famous school in Karachi committed to Shariah and promotes the non-profit educational system (Thobani, 2014). The mentioned school obtains the highest standards in academic and sports records. Also, it emphasizes Islamic morals and conduct. Another recognized name in the boundaries of education, Karachi, is The Intellect School, established in 2007, quoted on its official website; “Students must know that they are likely to act accordingly, inside or outside the premises of the school and to reflect their behavior as the representatives of Islam and the Intellect School at all times” (The Intellect School). In this way, modern schools are integrating Islamic education while making sure that students are ready and compete with the world globally.

Being an Islamic State, Pakistan is fully prepared and developed educational policy that firmly supports and holds Islamic color as the basic reason behind the demand for a separate homeland was based on Islamic ideology thus to peruse Islamic education and live according to Islam's teachings; for which this state came into being. The history of Pakistan suggests that there were lots of people who struggled with their lives and wealth only to get Pakistan as an independent state that would strengthen by religion. Hence, it is expected that the educational system of Pakistan must be Islamic integrated. Though many schools are not including Islamic education as per the need yet some of the schools in Pakistan are not fulfilling the needs of Islamic education which is why Islamic private schools are facilitating the needs of Islamic education in a modern way.

Methodology

Research Design and Approach

The research approach and design of this study are based on mixed methods wherein the qualitative approach is combined with a quantitative approach. While

using a qualitative approach, secondary research is being considered whereas in the quantitative approach, the research has performed primary research.

Data Collection

The data collection process is based on two tactics, namely the collection of secondary data by literature, and the collection of a past research paper, and primary data by surveying.

Data Analysis

To analyze primary data, the use of SPSS has been applied to the research data whereas, to analyze secondary data, the author has used the approach of constant comparative to analyze qualitative data.

Research Instrument

The literature review is the tool used to collect secondary data and the survey questionnaire is the tool used to collect primary information.

Reliability, and Validity of the Research

For making the research study and its results reliable, data that has been collected throughout the research is from reliable sources. Such as secondary data is collected through published research papers and reliable news articles whereas primary data is collected from the Pakistani population. On the other hand, the validity of this research is maintained by gathering the data from recent research papers and populations that have credible knowledge on the subject matter.

Results and Findings

It is the section which entails findings of data (primary and secondary) along with the discussion to analyze the extent of agreement and contradiction in primary and secondary data on the Islamic integrated education in Pakistan since 1947.

Frequencies

Table 1. Frequencies and Notes

Notes	
Output Created	13-JUL-2019 04:08:43
Comments	

Input	Data	C:\Users\name\Desktop\writing essayz\2.sav
	Active Dataset	DataSet0
	Filter	<none>
	Weight	<none>
	Split File	<none>
	N of Rows in Working Data File	100
Missing Value Handling	Definition of Missing	User-defined missing values are treated as missing.
	Cases Used	Statistics are based on all cases with valid data.
Syntax	FREQUENCIES VARIABLES=q1 q2 q3 q4 q5 /STATISTICS=STDDEV MEAN MEDIAN MODE /ORDER=ANALYSIS.	
Resources	Processor Time	00:00:00.00
	Elapsed Time	00:00:00.01

Statistics

Table 2. Statistics (Mean, Median, Mode, and Std. Deviation)

		Private modern schools currently in Pakistan are providing Islamic education as students should receive.	Islamic schools like Madrassas are providing secular education effectively.	Despite having national educational policies for maintaining an equilibrium between religious and secular education; schools are failing to adopt that balance.	Newly formed private schools that are based on Islamic education and provide secular education correspondingly are promising to create successful Islamic integrated education system	National Policies are needed to be implemented completely with its full essence so that modern private schools also provide Islamic education along with secular education as per the need.
N	Valid	100	100	100	100	100
	Missing	0	0	0	0	0
Mean		2.8000	2.5800	3.0100	2.8900	2.6500
Median		3.0000	3.0000	3.0000	3.0000	3.0000
Mode		1.00 ^a	4.00	2.00	4.00	1.00 ^a

Std. Deviation	1.35587	1.20755	.98980	1.35509	1.25831
-------------------	---------	---------	--------	---------	---------

Frequency Tables

Question No. 1

Table 3. Responses on Question No. 1

Private Modern Schools Currently in Pakistan are Providing Islamic Education as Students should Receive.					
		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Agree	25	25.0	25.0	25.0
	Agree	17	17.0	17.0	42.0
	Neutral	22	22.0	22.0	64.0
	Disagree	25	25.0	25.0	89.0
	Strongly Disagree	11	11.0	11.0	100.0
	Total	100	100.0	100.0	

In this statement, the respondents are asked about their perception regarding the learning of Islamic teachings taught at school level by modern schools in Pakistan. Being a Muslim country, learning and knowledge of Islamic studies is compulsory for every Muslim child living and learning from schools of PAKISTAN. This statement mainly asks the trend of learning Islamic teachings hold by students who are studying in highly modern schools that follow western schooling techniques and learning plans up to great extent. There are 25% and 17% of the respondents agree strongly on this statement and agree on the response. Besides, 22% of those interviewed respond to this statement with a neutral response. Also, 25% and 11% of respondents agree with this statement and strongly disagree with it. It reflects that most of the respondents mainly believe that students learning from modern schools of Pakistan should learn the Islamic teachings and studies taught by these modern schools performing education base activities in Pakistan.

Question No. 2

Table 4. Responses on Question No. 2

Islamic Schools like Madrassas are Providing Secular Education Effectively.					
		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Agree	27	27.0	27.0	27.0
	Agree	20	20.0	20.0	47.0
	Neutral	22	22.0	22.0	69.0
	Disagree	30	30.0	30.0	99.0

	Strongly Disagree	1	1.0	1.0	100.0
	Total	100	100.0	100.0	

In this statement, the respondents are asked about the type and nature of education provided by the Madrassas working in various cities, towns, and villages throughout entire Pakistan. The extent of secular education offered by Pakistani madrasas are providing to their student is asked from respondents in this statement. The state of the respondent is strongly in agreement and agrees in this regard with 27 and 20 percent. Apart from this, 22 % of respondents state that they are neutral. Moreover, 30% and 1% of the respondents disagree with this argument and strongly disagree. The variations of respondent's responses indicate that majority of respondents believe that madrassas which are operating at various locations in entire Pakistan are providing secular based education to their students. Therefore, the intervention of madrassas and their role in the enhancement of secular base education and trends in entire Pakistani society.

Question No. 3

Table 5. Responses on Question No. 3

Despite having National Educational Policies for Maintaining an Equilibrium between Religious and Secular Education; Schools are Failing to Adopt that Balance.					
		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Agree	41	41.0	41.0	41.0
	Neutral	24	24.0	24.0	65.0
	Disagree	28	28.0	28.0	93.0
	Strongly Disagree	7	7.0	7.0	100.0
	Total	100	100.0	100.0	

In this statement, the respondents are asked about the extent of balance between the Islamic and secular based education levels which can provide by the schools towards their students. Being an Islamic country, there is an immense need to develop an extensive balance among the religious base and modern education level and techniques which can be used to learn and teach the students learning in schools of Pakistan. For this, the response of 41 percent of respondents to this statement is accepted. Only 24 percent of respondents respond neutrally to this statement. In addition to this, respondents of 28 percent and 7 percent disagree with and strongly disagree with the answer to this argument. Overall, most of the respondents believe that there is an immense need to develop a balance among the level of religion and secular base education taught to students by the modern

schools working and performing in the Pakistan education sector. Through which, the policies implemented and design by the education department and authorities in this regard will play an effective role.

Question No. 4

Table 6. Responses on Question No. 4

Newly Formed Private Schools that are Based on Islamic Education and Provide Secular Education Correspondingly are Promising to Create Successful Islamic Integrated Education System					
		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Agree	23	23.0	23.0	23.0
	Agree	17	17.0	17.0	40.0
	Neutral	19	19.0	19.0	59.0
	Disagree	30	30.0	30.0	89.0
	Strongly Disagree	11	11.0	11.0	100.0
	Total	100	100.0	100.0	

In this statement, the respondents are asked about how the modern schools teaching and offering education facilities in Pakistan are increasing the level of secular education as well as increase the role and share of Islamic education in their school curriculum and other learning methods. Several new private schools are working and performing their education activities in Pakistani societies. Such modern schools mainly work to develop a link among modern business studies and trends along with the Islamic education systems as well. Through which the modern and Islamic both types of knowledge can increase among the earners up to a great extent. For this, 23 percent and 17 percent of respondent state strongly support and consent to this statement 's response. Just 19 percent of respondents say that this assertion is favorable. Additionally, 30% and 11% of respondents state a 'disagreement' and 'strongly disagree' response to this statement. A combination of the respondents ' answers is obtained. Respondents gave mixed responses to the statement. But 41 percent of respondents disagree with the response to this statement and 40 percent of respondent state agree with the response.

Question No. 5

Table 7. Responses on Question No. 5

National Policies are needed to be Implemented Completely with its Full Essence so that Modern Private Schools Also Provide Islamic Education Along with Secular Education as Per the Need.				
	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent

Valid	Strongly Agree	24	24.0	24.0	24.0
	Agree	23	23.0	23.0	47.0
	Neutral	24	24.0	24.0	71.0
	Disagree	22	22.0	22.0	93.0
	Strongly Disagree	7	7.0	7.0	100.0
	Total	100	100.0	100.0	

In this statement, the respondents are asked about the need to make initiatives and strategies from the central govt side to make sure that all the modern schools working in Pakistan provide Islamic education as well in addition to secular base education. Through this, the students can obtain both Islamic education and modern education simultaneously without making any difference among the quality of the education provided to the students of these modern schools. For this, 24% and 23% of the respondents state Strongly agree and agree to respond to this statement. Instead of this, 22% and 7% of respondents state Disagree and strongly disagree with the response towards this statement. On the other hand, 24% of respondents state Neutral responses towards this statement. This reflects that most of the respondents firmly believe that the central govt of Pakistan should take several initiatives and controlling measures through which the modern schools of a Pakistani education system can be restricted to make sufficient arrangements regarding the type and nature of education provided by these schools to their students. Through this, the students can learn both Islamic and secular education effectively and can enhance their learning level up to great extent.

Discussion

One of the most crucial crises that are faced by the current Muslim world is caused due to the problem of dualism in its educational system. There are two kinds of education system found in the litterateur; the first is the modern secular system which however follows national policies but failed to provide an adequate level of Islamic education and the second is the traditional religious-based education system which only emphasis on rote learning of Quran (Mahmood et al., 2016). Both of the systems have several shortcomings in terms of providing education that compliance with the challenges and needs of the globalized world. Pakistani people are dissatisfied with the type of education system as they have been realising that Islamic religious sciences that were taught in private schools are insufficient and ineffective. Meanwhile, the core of acquired sciences does not reveal the Islamic philosophies (Shakil & Akhtar, 2012). Although almost every school in Pakistan claims that their educational system is fully integrated with Islamic and science studies as per the national policies yet there is a great diversity found in terms of objectives, curricula, and content.

Summary

Many scholars have developed this chaotic situation in Pakistan's education system, which brought about the emergence of two different groups of people with contradictory views. The people who delve into the hereafter matters and the other group of people who are busy with worldly activities creating a dichotomy on the society. Thus, the role of modern Islamic integrated schools has been noticed which are providing quality education and population of Pakistan who was worried about acquiring the balance of both education (Islamic education and secular education) is found to be satisfied greatly in the studies as well as in the survey.

Conclusion and Recommendations

Education is the basic element that Islam strives for people to acquire irrespective of their ages. Since Pakistan has been founded based on demand to practice Islamic activities and achieve Islamic education freely. Education policies of Pakistan from its independence are focusing on maintaining Islamic education as a mandatory subject in the schools however it is noticed that despite the implementation of national educational policies, modern education system does not support completely the need for Islamic education. Similarly, schools that are purposely built for Islamic education are not provided sufficient secular education. Therefore, Islamic integrated education in Pakistan is much needed. From the age of 3 years to 4 years, a Muslim child in Pakistan is already exposed to several components of schooling and its surrounds, and constantly captivate the fundamental principles in many approaches of integration. It cannot be denied that religious education in Pakistan is one of the most important components of the educational system but many of the schools are either focused too much on the Islamic education side or too much on the secular education side. In this regard, the schools that are offering Islamic integrated education are very few in Pakistan but providing a balance of secular and Islamic education which allows their students to compete effectively in this globalized world.

In this regard, the recommendation for making the educational system that corresponds to the need for the globalized world is that schools in Pakistan must promote Islamic values and education in their schools not just as a subject but as the ideology. To have a full and effective Islamic education system, there should be a motivation that fascinates students to select Islamic education as their major subjects while acquiring a secular education.

References

- Ali, S. (2013). Pakistan: Target revision in education policy. *Education in West Central Asia*, 30, 163.
- Ali, Y. (2013). *How and to what extent can modern educational practices be employed to help make traditional Islamic education more meaningful and relevant for young Muslims living in Britain?* (Doctoral dissertation, Cardiff University).
- Amjad, R., & MacLeod, G. (2014). Academic effectiveness of private, public and private–public partnership schools in Pakistan. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 37, 22-31.
- Aziz, M., Bloom, D. E., Humair, S., Jimenez, E., Rosenberg, L., & Sathar, Z. (2014). *Education system reform in Pakistan: why, when, and how?* (No. 76). IZA Policy Paper.
- Burbules, N. C., & Torres, C. A. (2013). *Globalization and education: Critical perspectives*. Routledge.
- Durrani, N. (2013). Pakistan: Curriculum and the Construction of National Citizens. *Education in West Central Asia*, 30, 221.
- Fägerlind, I., & Saha, L. J. (2016). *Education and national development: A comparative perspective*. Elsevier.
- Green, A. (2013). Education and state formation. In *Education and state formation* (pp. 82-114). Palgrave Macmillan, London.
- Hameed-ur-Rehman, M., & Sewani, S. M. S. (2013). Critical Analysis of the Educational Policies of Pakistan. *Dialogue (Pakistan)*, 8(3).
- Heyneman, S. P., & Stern, J. M. (2014). Low cost private schools for the poor: What public policy is appropriate?. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 35, 3-15.
- Ichilov, O. (2013). *Citizenship and citizenship education in a changing world*. Routledge.
- Jackson, R. (2013). *Rethinking religious education and plurality: Issues in diversity and pedagogy*. Routledge.

- Khattak, S. G. (2014). A comparative analysis of the elite–English-medium schools, state Urdu-medium schools, and Dini-madaris in Pakistan. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Comparative Studies*, 1(1), 92-107.
- Mahmood, S., Ahmed, S., Zubair, M., Ali, Q., & Khan, H. (2016). Educational system of Pakistan: Critical analysis in Islamic perspective. *Asian Journal of Management Sciences and Education*, 5(3), 96-103.
- Mehdi, R. (2013). *The Islamization of the Law in Pakistan (RLE Politics of Islam)*. Routledge.
- Rust, V. D., & Arribas Layton, L. (2018). Islamic Education in Pakistan. *Handbook of Islamic Education*, 731-744.
- Shakil, A. F., & Akhtar, S. H. (2012). Consideration of Islamic Values in the Educational Policies of Pakistan. *Journal of Educational and Social Research*, 2, 1. The Intellect School. <https://www.theintellect.edu.pk/>
- Thobani, S. (2014). Contemporary madrasas and contested modernities: Educational reform in Pakistan. In *Muslim Education in the 21st Century* (pp. 48-66). Routledge.
- Yasin, F. B. R., & Jani, M. (2013). Islamic education: The philosophy, aim, and main features. *International Journal of Education and Research*, 1(10), 1-18.